

# HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION HEARING SYNOPSIS WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 3, 2005

Regular Session 6:00 P.M. City Hall, Room 205 801 North First Street San Jose, CA

# **COMMISSION MEMBERS**

MICHAEL YOUMANS, VICE CHAIR

PATRICIA COLOMBE
EDWARD JANKE
HELENE LAVELLE

JUSTINE LEONG
MARTIN ALKIRE
SCOTT CUNNINGHAM

STEPHEN M. HAASE, AICP, DIRECTOR DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, BUILDING AND CODE ENFORCEMENT

# NOTE

To arrange an accommodation under the Americans with Disabilities Act to participate in this public meeting, we ask that you call (408) 277-4576 (VOICE) or (408) 998-5299 (TTY) at least two business days before the meeting.

# NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC

Good evening, my name is **Michael Youmans**, and I am the Vice Chair of the Historic Landmarks Commission. On behalf of the Commission, I would like to welcome you to tonight's meeting. I will now call to order the <u>August 3, 2005</u> meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission. Please remember to turn off your cell phones and pagers.

If you want to address the Commission, fill out a speaker card (located at the technician's station), and give the completed card to the technician. Please include the agenda item number for reference.

# The procedure for public hearings is as follows:

- After the staff report, applicants may make a five-minute presentation.
- Anyone wishing to speak in favor of the proposal should prepare to come forward. Each speaker will have two minutes.
- After the proponents speak, anyone wishing to speak in opposition should prepare to come forward. Each speaker will have two minutes.
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- The Commission will then close the public hearing. The Historic Landmarks Commission will take action on the item.

#### The procedure for referrals is as follows:

- Anyone wishing to speak on a referral will be limited to one minute.
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- The Historic Landmarks Commission will comment on the referral item.

If a Commissioner would like a topic to be addressed under one of the Good and Welfare items, please contact Planning staff in advance of the Commission meeting.

An agenda and a copy of all staff reports have been placed on the table for your convenience.

#### **AGENDA**

# **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

#### 6:00 PM SESSION

# 1. ROLL CALL

#### **ALL PRESENT**

• Introduction of New Commission Members

# 2. DEFERRALS

Any item scheduled for hearing this evening for which deferral is being requested will be taken out of order to be heard first on the matter of deferral. A list of staff-recommended deferrals is available on the table. If you want to change any of the deferral dates recommended or speak to the question of deferring these or any other items, you should say so at this time.

The matter of deferrals is now closed.

# 3. CONSENT CALENDAR

#### NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC

The consent calendar items are considered to be routine and will be adopted by one motion. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a request is made by a member of the Historic Landmarks Commission, staff or the public to have an item removed from the consent calendar and considered separately. If anyone in the audience wishes to speak on one of these items, please make your request at this time.

a. APPROVAL OF THE JUNE 1, 2005 HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SYNOPSIS.

**APPROVED (7-0)** 

The Consent Calendar is now closed.

# 4. **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

a. HP05-004. Historic Preservation Permit to allow exterior modifications to the State Meat Market Building (City Landmark No. HL92-70) in the Downtown Commercial National Register Historic District on a 0.14 gross acre site located at/on the southwest corner of East Santa Clara Street and South 4th Street (142 E SANTA CLARA ST). Council District 3. SNI: University. CEQA: Exempt.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION ADOPTED WITH THE ADDED CONDITION THAT FUTURE SIGNS NOT COVER ANY HISTORIC BUILDING FEATURES, INCLUDING THE EXPOSED BEARING PLATES (7-0).

VICE CHAIR YOUMANS ASKED HOW THE MISSING CAPITALS WOULD BE TREATED. THE ARCHITECT, MARK SANDOVAL, EXPLAINED THAT MOLDS WOULD BE CREATED FROM THE EXISTING CAPITALS SO THAT THE MISSING CAPITALS WOULD BE REPLACED IN KIND.

VICE CHAIR YOUMANS CONFIRMED THAT THE PROJECT AS CURRENTLY PROPOSED DOES NOT INCLUDE WORK ON THE REAR OF THE BUILDING. FUTURE PROPOSED WORK WILL REQUIRE SUBSEQUENT PERMITS.

COMMISSIONER ALKIRE ASKED WHETHER THE ARCHITECT WAS ABLE TO DETERMINE THE AGE OF THE SIGN. THE ARCHITECT REPLIED THAT THERE WAS NOT ENOUGH INFORMATION TO DETERMINE ITS AGE. THE FAILING CEMENT PLASTER BEHIND THE SIGN INDICATES THAT IT IS OLDER.

COMMISSIONER COLOMBE NOTICED THAT FIN SIGNS WERE PROPOSED, BUT WAS CONCERNED ABOUT RANDOM UGLY SIGNS BEING PLACED ON THE BUILDING IN THE FUTURE AND POSSIBLY COVERING UP THE BEARING PLATES ON THE REINFORCED MASONRY.

COMMISSIONER LEONG ASKED WHETHER ANY HISTORIC PHOTOS HAD BEEN LOCATED FOR THE BUILDING. THE ARCHITECT REPLIED THAT THE PROJECT DOES NOT PROPOSE ALTERATIONS TO HISTORIC STOREFRONTS, BUT RATHER TO RECENTLY LESS COMPATIBLE REMODELED STOREFRONTS.

COMMISSIONER CUNNINGHAM ASKED WHETHER THE TILE FINISH AT THE ENTRY WAS ORIGINAL TO THE BUILDING OR A LATER ADDITION. THE ARCHITECT REPLIED THAT AS MUCH HISTORIC FABRIC AS POSSIBLE WOULD BE RETAINED IN PLACE, WHILE SOME WOULD BE RELOCATED OR MATCHED IN KIND IN ORDER TO ORGANIZE THE STOREFRONTS IN A MANNER THAT IS SENSITIVE TO THE LOWER PORTIONS OF THE BUILDING.

# 5. REFERRALS FROM CITY COUNCIL, BOARDS, COMMISSIONS OR OTHER AGENCIES

a. G69. National Historic Preservation Act Review of the Thirteenth Street SNI One-way Couplet Historic Lighting Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funding request for the installation of 34 pedestrian-scale antique-style streetlights within the public rights-of-way on both sides of N. Third St. between the Union Pacific Railroad tracks and E. Julian St.; both sides of N. Fourth St. between Hensley Ave. and E. Julian St.; and the south side of Hensley Avenue and the north side of E. Julian St., between N. Third and N. Fourth Sts.; within the Hensley National Register Historic District. (Lindsey Fonick, Project Manager, San Jose Redevelopment Agency) Council District 3. SNI: 13<sup>th</sup> Street. CEQA: Exempt.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION ADOPTED WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE PROJECT ENGINEER REVIEW ANY SUBTERRANEAN ARCHAEOLOGICAL FINDINGS BASED ON THE HISTORIC 1854 PLAT MAP LOCATING AN UNDERGROUND IRRIGATION CANAL. APPROVED (7-0-0).

LINDSEY FONICK, OF SJRA, GAVE A PROJECT OVERVIEW.

VICE CHAIR YOUMANS CONFIRMED THAT THE PROPOSED LIGHTS ARE CURRENTLY FOUND IN OTHER LOCATIONS WITHIN THE NEIGHBORHOOD AND CITY.

COMMISSIONER COLOMBE RECOMMENDED THAT FUTURE DEVELOPMENTS ON THE SALVATION ARMY SITE ON FOURTH STREET WOULD INCLUDE APPROPRIATE LOCATION OF HISTORIC STREETLIGHTS. SHE ASKED WHY THE PROJECT DESCRIPTION REFERRED TO THE JACKSON TAYLOR NEIGHBORHOOD REVITALIZATION PLAN.

MANUEL LIMA OF THE HENSLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT STATED THAT ROUGHLY 15 YEARS AGO, THE HENSLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT WAS PART OF THE JACKSON TAYLOR NEIGHBORHOOD DISTRICT. MR LIMA SPOKE IN FAVOR OF THE PROJECT.

COMMISSIONER LEONG STATED THAT AN 1854 RECORDED MAP INDICATES THE EXISTENCE OF AN ACEQUIA, OR HISTORIC IRRIGATION CANAL ASSOCIATED WITH EARLY SAN JOSE, RUNNING NORTH TO SOUTH BETWEEN THIRD AND FOURTH STREETS. SHE SUBMITTED THE PLAT MAP FOR THE PUBLIC RECORD, INDICATING THAT THE AREA OF ARCHAEOLOGICAL SENSITIVITY HAS POTENTIAL HISTORICAL RESOURCES.

COMMISSIONER ALKIRE ASKED WHETHER WHITE LIGHTING HAD BEEN CONSIDERED FOR THE PROJECT. MS. FONICK REPLIED THAT THE FIXTURES WOULD BE HIGH-PRESSURE SODIUM, AS OPPOSED TO THE CITY STANDARD OF LOW-PRESSURE SODIUM, SO THAT THE LIGHT WOULD NOT BE ORANGE.

COMMISSIONER COLOMBE ASKED FOR CLARIFICATION ON THE GRAPHICS INDICATING MARKERS WITHIN THE PROJECT AREA. MS. FONICK CLARIFIED THAT THE PROJECT PROPOSAL DID NOT INCLUDE MARKERS, ONLY LIGHT FIXTURES.

# 6. PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS

Public comments to the Historic Landmarks Commission on non-agendized items. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to two minutes. The Commission cannot take any formal action without the item being properly noticed and placed on an agenda. In response to public comment, the Historic Landmarks Commission is limited to the following options:

- 1. Responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public; or
- 2. Requesting staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting; or
- 3. Directing staff to place the item on a future agenda.
- a. Public Comment

VICE CHAIR YOUMANS ASKED THAT WORK UNDER WAY ON PELLIER PARK BE PLACED ON THE NEXT HLC AGENDA.

b. Brendan Rawson petition for Commission to reconsider Item 5.c to allow residential units located adjacent to Germania Hall City Landmark on the April 6, 2005 Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Synopsis.

MR. RAWSON STATED THAT THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION'S COMMENTS WERE NOT CLEARLY REFLECTED IN THE PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT. HE ASKED THE HLC TO AMEND THE SYNOPSIS TO INCLUDE A STRONGER STATEMENT REGARDING THE INCOMPATIBILITY OF THE PROPOSED RESIDENTIAL PROJECT WITH THE GERMANIA HALL.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, JOE HORWEDEL, NOTED THAT THE PLANNING COMMISSION DISCUSSED THE QUESTION OF REZONING THE PROPERTY BE CONFORM TO THE DC ZONING DISTRICT. THE PROJECT WAS REFERRED TO THE HLC AND THE HLC SYNOPSIS WAS ATTACHED TO THE STAFF REPORT, HOWEVER THE DECISION RESPONSIBILITY RESTS WITH THE CITY COUNCIL ON THE REZONING AND WITH THE DIRECTOR OF PLANNING ON THE SITE PERMIT.

VICE CHAIR YOUMANS RE-STATED THAT THE HLC WOULD NOT AMEND THE APRIL 6, 2005 HLC HEARING SYNOPSIS.

# 7. GOOD AND WELFARE

a. Report from the Redevelopment Agency

# b. Report from the Secretary

- Status of Circulation of Environmental Review Documents
  - Flea Market Planned Development Rezoning DEIR anticipated in Fall 2005
- Japantown Refined Historic Context and Intensive Level Survey

VICE CHAIR YOUMANS NOTED THAT THE SURVEY COMMITTEE SHOULD WATCH FOR ERRORS REGARDING PARCEL NUMBERS, ADDRESSES, AND PROPERTY DESCRIPTIONS, SUCH AS THOSE MADE BY CONSULTANTS ON THE EAST DOWNTOWN FRAME SURVEY.

- San Jose Industrial/High Tech Context
- Crystal Morrow, Council Aide to HLC City Council Liaison Linda LeZotte
- Selection of HLC Representatives for Salvage Tours

COMMISSIONERS AGREED TO ELECT REPRESENTATIVES TO ATTEND SALVAGE TOURS ON A CASE-BY-CASE BASIS. COMMISSIONER ALKIRE NOTED THAT PRIVATE ARCHITECTURAL SALVAGE COMPANIES MIGHT BE INTERESTED IN ITEMS NOT CHOSEN BY HISTORY SAN JOSE OR THE HLC FOR SALVAGE. JOE HORWEDEL NOTED THAT ONE OF THE CITY'S GOALS IS TO REDUCE LANDFILL. THE FIRST INTEREST IN SALVAGE IS TO PROTECT THE NON-PROFIT ENTITIES' ABILITIES TO SALVAGE ITEMS, THEN PRIVATE BUSINESSES MAY BE CONSULTED.

# c. Report from the Subcommittees

- Report of the Design Review Committee
  - July 20, 2005 meeting cancelled, No Report
  - June 29, 2005 Report Commissioner Leong, DRC Chair

# **REPORT ACCEPTED (7-0-0)**

- HLC Discussion re: moving DRC meeting date to HLC meeting date

VICE CHAIR YOUMANS CLARIFIED THAT ITEMS HEARD AT THE DRC MEETING COULD NOT BE HEARD THE SAME EVENING AT THE HLC MEETING.

COMMISSIONER COLOMBE STATED THAT IT WAS A GOOD IDEA TO HOLD BOTH MEETINGS ON THE SAME EVENING.

COMMISSIONER JANKE STATED THAT HE PREFERRED THE NOON TIME MEETING AND HAD CONCERNS ABOUT HOW THE DRC MEETING WOULD IMPACT THE HLC MEETING START-TIME.

COMMISSIONER PREFERRED THE LUNCH TIME MEETING, BUT HAD NO PROBLEMS WITH EITHER TIME.

JOE HORWEDEL NOTED THAT THE PLANNING COMMISSION PLANNED TO MOVE ITS MEETING TIME TO 6:30 TO PROVIDE FREE PARKING FOR THE PUBLIC AFTER 6:00 PM. THE HLC MIGHT WANT TO CONSIDER THAT TIME CHANGE AS WELL BECAUSE THE HLC ONLY MEETS ONCE A MONTH. TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION OF THE CITY COUNCIL FOCUS ON SERVICE, THE HLC MIGHT CONSIDER THAT CONSOLIDATING THE DATE OF THE MEETINGS COULD RUN THE RISK OF HOLDING APPLICANTS IN THE QUEUE FOR MINOR APPLICATIONS.

THE CONSENSUS WAS THAT THE DRC WOULD CONTINUE TO MEET ON THE THIRD WEDNESDAY OF EACH MONTH FROM 12 NOON TO 1:30 PM.

History San Jose Collections Committee

Vice Chair Youmans, Liaison

- Coyote Valley Specific Plan and Habitat Conservation Plan Technical Advisory Committee
- d. Election of Commission Chair, Vice Chair, Design Review Subcommittee Member, Liaison to the Coyote Valley Advisory Committee, Liaison to the Japantown Survey Committee, and Liaison to the Industrial High Tech Context Project.

MOTION TO ELECT VICE CHAIR YOUMANS AS CHAIR AND COMMISSIONER JANKE AS VICE CHAIR. APPROVED (7-0-0)

MOTION TO ELECT COMMISSIONER COLOMBE AS DRC MEMBER AND COMMISSIONER CUNNINGHAM AS ALTERNATE. APPROVED (7-0-0)

SEEING NO VOLUNTEERS FOR THE LIAISON TO THE COYOTE VALLEY ADVISORY COMMITTEE LIAISON, NO LIAISON WAS ELECTED.

MOTION TO ELECT COMMISSIONER ALKIRE AS LIAISON TO JAPANTOWN SURVEY COMMITTEE. APPROVED (7-0-0)

MOTION TO ELECT COMMISSIONER LA VELLE AS LIAISON TO INDUSTRIAL HIGH TECH CONTEXT PROJECT. APPROVED (7-0-0)

# 8. ADJOURNMENT

MEETING RE-OPENED TO ADDRESS THE CHANGE OF TIME FOR THE HLC MEETING IN ORDER TO ALLOW FREE PARKING AFTER 6:00 PM IN THE NEW CITY HALL.

MOTION TO CHANGE THE TIME OF THE MEETING TO 6:30 PM IN ORDER TO ACCOMMODATE FREE PARKING FOR THE PUBLIC. APPROVED (7-0-0)

MEETING ADJOURNED.

# 2005 HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULE

DATE	TIME	TYPE OF M EETING	LOCATION
April 6, 2005	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room 300
April 20, 2005	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Meeting	Room 400
April 22, 2005	12:30- 4:30 p.m.	Retreat	MLK Jr. Library,
•	-	Cultural Heritage Room, 5 <sup>th</sup> Floor	
May 4, 2005	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room 205
May 18, 2005	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Meeting	Room 400
June 1, 2005	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room 205
June 29, 2005	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Meeting	Room 400
July 20, 2005	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Meeting	Cancelled
August 3, 2005	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room 205
August 17, 2005	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Meeting	Room 400

# Meetings September 7<sup>th</sup> and subsequent located in Council Chambers on 200 East Santa Clara St.

September 7, 2005	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Council Chambers
September 21, 2005	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Meeting	TBA
October 5, 2005	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Council Chambers
October 19, 2005	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Meeting	TBA
November 2, 2005	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Council Chambers
November 16, 2005	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Meeting	TBA
December 7, 2005	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Council Chambers
December 21, 2005	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Meeting	TBA

# HISTORIC LANDMARKS AGENDA ON THE WEB:

http://www.sanjoseca.gov/planning/hearings/index.htm